

Department of Linguistics and English Language, Lancaster University
Corpus Research Group
Language, Ideology & Power Research Group

Towards quantifying ‘quality’ in the press

**Comparing the stance of UK tabloids and broadsheets
towards refugees, asylum seekers and immigrants**

Costas Gabrielatos

13 June 2006

Abstract

This talk reports work on an ongoing project on the representation of refugees and asylum seekers in the UK press. Although the project combines approaches within critical discourse analysis and corpus linguistics, the aim of this talk is to examine how corpus-based techniques can contribute to CDA (e.g. Baker & McEnery, 2005, Hardt-Mautner, 1995; Orpin, 2005; Sotillo & Wang-Gempp, 2004). The analysis is based on two corpora comprising articles relevant to refugees and asylum seekers from 12 national UK newspapers, spanning the last ten years: six broadsheets (87 million words) and six tabloids (30 million words).

The starting points for the analysis are keywords, key collocations of the terms *refugee(s)*, *asylum seeker(s)*, *immigrant(s)*, *migrants(s)* and *alien(s)*, as well as key n-grams containing these terms and selected key collocates. The study also makes use of the notions of *semantic prosody* (Louw, 1993: 157), and, more significantly, Stubbs' expanded notion of *discourse prosody* (2001: 111-112). Semantic prosodies can help create a *topos* without totally explicit argumentation, in that readers are more likely to attend to the connotational rather than the denotational level of specific frequent collocations (e.g. swarms of refugees) (see also van Dijk, 1991: 228; 2000: 219-220), or, in other words, accept the metaphor rather than engage critically with it. This seems more likely if we consider that the frequency of semantic/discourse prosodies is greater than that of the different collocation patterns (e.g. bogus/fake asylum seekers, illegal immigrants) which embody or give rise to it. For example, the *topoi* of *burdening/weighing down*, *definition*, *aggregation* and *quantification* (Reisigl & Wodak, 2001: 76-78; Sedlak, 2001: 129) can be created or supported/reinforced by the collective use of quantity/mass/group collocates (e.g. *flood/river/tide/wave of refugees*; *hordes/gangs of refugees*), which give rise to negative semantic prosodies related to the perceived inordinate number or threat of refugees.

The comparison will be based on the examination of ...

- keywords in the two corpora when compared to each other;
- collocates of *refugees* related to their perceived inordinate numbers and their reported plight;
- concordances of negative collocates of the groups in question related to the *topoi* of abuse, burden, competition and criminality;
- concordances of collocates related to the plight of the groups in question.

References

- Baker, J.P. & McEnery, A.M. (2005). A corpus-based approach to discourses of refugees and asylum seekers. *Journal of Language and Politics*, 4(2), 197-226.
- van Dijk, T.A. (1991). *Racism and the Press*. London and New York: Routledge
- van Dijk, T.A. (2000). The reality of racism. On analyzing parliamentary debates on immigration. In Zurstiege, G. (ed.). *Festschrift für die Wirklichkeit*. Wiesbaden: Westdeutscher Verlag, 211-226.
- Hardt-Mautner, G. (1995). Critical discourse analysis and corpus linguistics. *UCREL Technical Papers*, 6.
- Louw, B. (1993). Irony in the text or insincerity in the writer? The diagnostic potential of semantic prosodies. In Baker, M., Francis, G. & Tognini-Bonelli, E. (eds.) *Text and technology: In honour of John Sinclair*, Philadelphia and Amsterdam: John Benjamins, 157-176.
- Orpin, D. (2005). Corpus linguistics and critical discourse analysis: Examining the ideology of sleaze. *International Journal of Corpus Linguistics*, 10(1), 37-61.
- Reisigl, M. & Wodak, R. (2001). *Discourse and Discrimination*. London: Routledge
- Sedlak, M. (2001). You really do make an unrespectable foreign policy. In Wodak, R. & van Dijk, T.A. (eds.) *Racism at the Top: Parliamentary discourses on ethnic issues in six European states*, 107-168.
- Sotillo, S.M. & Wang-Gempp, J. (2004). Using corpus linguistics to investigate class, ideology, and discursive practices in online political discussions: Pedagogical applications of corpora. In Connor, U. & Upton, T.A. (eds.) *Applied corpus linguistics*, 91-122.
- Stubbs, M. (2001). *Words and phrases: Corpus studies of lexical semantics*. Oxford: Blackwell.
- ter Wal, J. (2002). Racism and cultural diversity in the mass media: An overview of research and examples of good practice in the EU Member States, 1995-2000. European Research Centre on Migration and Ethnic Relations (ERCOMER).

The corpora

| TABLOIDS (29,883,001 words) | BROADSHEETS (87,001,072 words) |
|---|--|
| <i>Express</i> | <i>Business</i> |
| <i>Daily Mail</i> + <i>Mail on Sunday</i> | <i>Guardian + Observer</i> |
| <i>Daily Mirror</i> + <i>Sunday Mirror</i> | <i>Independent</i> + <i>Independent on Sunday</i> |
| <i>People</i> | <i>Telegraph</i> + <i>Sunday Telegraph</i> |
| <i>Star</i> | <i>Times + Sunday Times</i> |
| <i>Sun</i> | |

Query

refugee OR asylum OR deport* OR immigr*
OR emigr* OR migrant OR illegal alien OR
illegal entry OR leave to remain
AND NOT deportivo AND NOT department

Approach

- From 'big picture' ...
- to close examination ...
- to 'big picture' (not included)

- Annotation → grouping → quantification

Areas examined

- Key words related to *topoi*
- Collocates of *refugees* related to *topoi*
- *n-grams* containing *illegal*, *fake*
- Discourse around *suffocated*

Key words

- Statistic: Log Likelihood (LL)
- In all cases, $p < 0.000000000001$ (1/100 billion)
- Min. frequency: 5
- **Red** indicates more frequent in **tabloids**
- **Blue** indicates more frequent in **broadsheets**

Query (and related) terms

| Key word | Freq.-T | <i>T/mil</i> | Freq.-B | <i>B/mil</i> | LL |
|-------------|---------|--------------|---------|--------------|----------|
| emigrated | 2,952 | 98.95 | 4,436 | 50.99 | 733.75 |
| emigrating | 723 | 24.23 | 1,199 | 13.78 | 135.66 |
| immigrant | 4,784 | 160.36 | 11,016 | 126.62 | 180.15 |
| immigrants | 16,946 | 568.02 | 25,668 | 295.03 | 4,126.68 |
| immigration | 24,899 | 834.60 | 44,226 | 508.34 | 3,710.86 |
| migrants | 4,441 | 148.86 | 8,514 | 97.86 | 488.70 |
| refugee | 10,432 | 349.67 | 24,011 | 275.99 | 394.29 |
| refugees | 20,270 | 679.44 | 43,435 | 499.25 | 1,261.40 |
| claimant | 62 | 2.08 | 825 | 9.48 | 206.27 |
| emigre | 154 | 5.16 | 1,766 | 20.30 | 389.41 |
| emigres | 85 | 2.85 | 1,031 | 11.85 | 238.95 |
| foreign | 8,973 | 300.77 | 38,533 | 442.90 | 1,178.53 |

Entry (general)

| Key word | Freq.-T | <i>T/mil</i> | Freq.-B | <i>B/mil</i> | LL |
|-----------------|----------------|---------------------|----------------|---------------------|-----------|
| arrivals | 1,006 | 33.72 | 1,774 | 20.39 | 153.78 |
| arrive | 2,211 | 74.11 | 4,392 | 50.48 | 206.87 |
| arrived | 6,868 | 230.21 | 14,618 | 168.02 | 444.89 |
| arriving | 2,387 | 80.01 | 3,967 | 45.60 | 444.92 |
| passengers | 2,211 | 74.11 | 4,603 | 52.91 | 162.53 |

Entry (mode)

| n-gram | Freq.-T | <i>T/mil</i> | Freq.-B | <i>B/mil</i> | LL |
|---------------|----------------|---------------------|----------------|---------------------|-----------|
| eurostar | 805 | 26.98 | 905 | 10.40 | 366.81 |
| ferries | 527 | 17.66 | 532 | 6.11 | 284.49 |
| ferry | 1,745 | 58.49 | 2,289 | 26.31 | 595.36 |
| container | 707 | 23.70 | 802 | 9.22 | 317.28 |
| train | 3,844 | 128.85 | 8,548 | 98.25 | 187.92 |
| trains | 1,833 | 61.44 | 2,866 | 32.94 | 409.35 |
| truck | 1,409 | 47.23 | 2,083 | 23.94 | 365.21 |
| trucker | 197 | 6.60 | 44 | 0.51 | 334.73 |
| truckers | 233 | 7.81 | 104 | 1.20 | 280.96 |
| lorries | 1,019 | 34.16 | 1,334 | 15.33 | 349.11 |
| lorry | 2,569 | 86.11 | 2,616 | 30.07 | 1,369.18 |

Entry (place/route)

| Key word | Freq.-T | <i>T/mil</i> | Freq.-B | <i>B/mil</i> | LL |
|-----------------|----------------|---------------------|----------------|---------------------|-----------|
| calais | 2,310 | 77.43 | 1,825 | 20.98 | 1,707.81 |
| channel | 4,387 | 147.05 | 8,227 | 94.56 | 529.99 |
| chunnel | 283 | 9.49 | 32 | 0.37 | 584.54 |
| dover | 2,171 | 72.77 | 2,500 | 28.74 | 949.43 |
| eurotunnel | 967 | 32.41 | 1,128 | 12.97 | 413.42 |
| heathrow | 1,731 | 58.02 | 2,951 | 33.92 | 297.19 |
| tunnel | 2,379 | 79.74 | 2,788 | 32.05 | 1,008.77 |

Entry (illegal)

| Key word | Freq.-T | <i>T/mil</i> | Freq.-B | <i>B/mil</i> | LL |
|-----------------|----------------|---------------------|----------------|---------------------|-----------|
| passport | 5,273 | 176.75 | 7,389 | 84.93 | 1,555.96 |
| passports | 2,850 | 095.53 | 3,581 | 41.16 | 1,060.94 |
| smuggle | 791 | 26.51 | 828 | 9.52 | 404.33 |
| smuggled | 1,233 | 41.33 | 1,458 | 16.76 | 514.48 |
| smuggling | 1,570 | 52.63 | 2,484 | 28.55 | 339.08 |
| sneak | 682 | 22.86 | 391 | 4.49 | 685.03 |
| sneaked | 290 | 09.72 | 175 | 2.01 | 279.08 |
| sneaking | 304 | 10.19 | 235 | 2.70 | 230.22 |
| stowaway | 270 | 09.05 | 194 | 2.23 | 220.83 |
| stowaways | 847 | 28.39 | 420 | 4.83 | 950.53 |

Legality

| Key word | Freq.-T | <i>T/mil</i> | Freq.-B | <i>B/mil</i> | LL |
|-----------------|----------------|---------------------|----------------|---------------------|-----------|
| bogus | 3,836 | 128.58 | 2,557 | 29.39 | 3,376.31 |
| failed | 7,078 | 237.25 | 14,136 | 162.48 | 645.28 |
| fake | 1,474 | 49.41 | 1,619 | 18.61 | 698.09 |
| false | 2,581 | 86.51 | 4,636 | 53.29 | 368.99 |
| genuine | 2,767 | 92.75 | 4,826 | 55.47 | 439.69 |
| illegal | 13,637 | 457.10 | 15,687 | 180.31 | 5,976.18 |
| illegally | 2,392 | 80.18 | 2,724 | 31.31 | 1,066.38 |
| illegals | 992 | 33.25 | 380 | 4.37 | 1,313.36 |
| legal | 7,043 | 236.08 | 15,749 | 181.02 | 331.13 |
| legally | 943 | 31.61 | 1,675 | 19.25 | 140.45 |
| posing | 599 | 20.08 | 854 | 9.82 | 169.71 |
| authentic | 176 | 5.90 | 1,106 | 12.71 | 107.10 |
| legitimacy | 94 | 3.15 | 767 | 8.82 | 115.20 |

Number

| Key word | Freq.-T | <i>T/mil</i> | Freq.-B | <i>B/mil</i> | LL |
|-----------------|----------------|---------------------|----------------|---------------------|-----------|
| flood | 1,532 | 51.35 | 2,285 | 26.26 | 388.22 |
| flooding | 598 | 20.04 | 816 | 9.38 | 187.39 |
| hundreds | 4,671 | 156.57 | 10,667 | 122.61 | 187.81 |
| influx | 1,378 | 46.19 | 2,387 | 27.44 | 224.20 |
| number | 12,862 | 431.13 | 30,061 | 345.52 | 427.99 |
| numbers | 4,709 | 157.84 | 10,929 | 125.62 | 166.25 |
| rocketed | 196 | 6.57 | 172 | 1.98 | 127.96 |
| swamped | 501 | 16.79 | 774 | 8.90 | 115.65 |
| thousands | 8,840 | 296.31 | 17,508 | 201.24 | 839.04 |
| dozen | 1,021 | 34.22 | 4,226 | 48.57 | 108.06 |

Residence

| Key word | Freq.-T | <i>T/mil</i> | Freq.-B | <i>B/mil</i> | LL |
|-----------------|----------------|---------------------|----------------|---------------------|-----------|
| citizenship | 2,195 | 73.58 | 4,554 | 52.34 | 164.42 |
| claim | 6,976 | 233.83 | 14,358 | 165.03 | 545.64 |
| claimants | 580 | 19.44 | 983 | 11.30 | 101.52 |
| claimed | 8,071 | 270.53 | 11,916 | 136.96 | 2,099.32 |
| claiming | 3,256 | 109.14 | 4,404 | 50.62 | 1,040.41 |
| claims | 8,182 | 274.26 | 14,108 | 162.16 | 1,352.47 |
| permit | 1,013 | 33.96 | 1,992 | 22.90 | 99.42 |
| permits | 1,148 | 38.48 | 1,788 | 20.55 | 259.16 |

Abuse of system

| Key word | Freq.-T | <i>T/mil</i> | Freq.-B | <i>B/mil</i> | LL |
|-----------------|----------------|---------------------|----------------|---------------------|-----------|
| abuse | 3,264 | 109.42 | 6,077 | 69.85 | 406.09 |
| abused | 1,024 | 34.32 | 1,688 | 19.40 | 195.77 |
| abusing | 427 | 14.31 | 535 | 6.15 | 159.83 |
| bride | 809 | 27.12 | 866 | 9.95 | 399.34 |
| brides | 211 | 7.07 | 226 | 2.60 | 104.06 |
| cheat | 296 | 9.92 | 288 | 3.31 | 168.50 |
| cheating | 262 | 8.78 | 292 | 3.36 | 121.13 |
| cheats | 581 | 19.47 | 224 | 2.57 | 766.37 |
| marriage | 5,597 | 187.61 | 8,722 | 100.25 | 1,261.74 |
| marriages | 1,207 | 40.46 | 1,820 | 20.92 | 297.33 |
| married | 7,249 | 242.98 | 12,830 | 147.47 | 1,093.84 |
| marry | 1,753 | 58.76 | 2,083 | 23.94 | 725.06 |
| marrying | 594 | 19.91 | 764 | 8.78 | 211.04 |
| racket | 751 | 25.17 | 531 | 6.10 | 624.26 |
| racketeers | 224 | 7.51 | 147 | 1.69 | 200.04 |
| scam | 1,308 | 43.84 | 695 | 7.99 | 1,394.93 |
| scams | 261 | 8.75 | 271 | 3.11 | 135.08 |
| wedding | 2,487 | 83.36 | 2,852 | 32.78 | 1,095.51 |
| weddings | 407 | 13.64 | 568 | 6.53 | 121.22 |

Financial considerations ('their' side)

| n-gram | Freq.-T | <i>T/mil</i> | Freq.-B | <i>B/mil</i> | LL |
|---------------|----------------|---------------------|----------------|---------------------|-----------|
| benefit | 3,413 | 114.40 | 6,425 | 73.85 | 405.83 |
| benefits | 5,431 | 182.04 | 7,257 | 83.41 | 1,781.92 |
| handout | 174 | 5.83 | 85 | 0.98 | 197.35 |
| handouts | 828 | 27.75 | 289 | 3.32 | 1,153.85 |
| job | 9,748 | 326.75 | 21,071 | 242.19 | 574.71 |
| jobs | 4,294 | 143.93 | 10,369 | 119.18 | 105.23 |
| scroungers | 301 | 10.09 | 241 | 2.77 | 219.20 |
| spongers | 145 | 4.86 | 66 | 0.76 | 172.61 |

Financial considerations ('our' side)

| n-gram | Freq.-T | <i>T/mil</i> | Freq.-B | <i>B/mil</i> | LL |
|---------------|----------------|---------------------|----------------|---------------------|-----------|
| cost | 7,039 | 235.94 | 12,323 | 141.64 | 1,104.11 |
| costing | 880 | 29.50 | 767 | 8.82 | 579.45 |
| expense | 996 | 33.39 | 1,716 | 19.72 | 165.05 |
| jobless | 338 | 11.33 | 409 | 4.70 | 135.20 |
| rocketed | 196 | 6.57 | 172 | 1.98 | 127.96 |
| strain | 835 | 27.99 | 1,448 | 16.64 | 135.34 |
| taxes | 2,139 | 71.70 | 4,152 | 47.72 | 222.78 |
| taxpayer | 1,409 | 47.23 | 741 | 8.52 | 1,514.40 |
| taxpayers | 2,555 | 85.64 | 1,104 | 12.69 | 3,145.99 |

Financial considerations (misc)

| n-gram | Freq.-T | <i>T/mil</i> | Freq.-B | <i>B/mil</i> | LL |
|-------------------------|----------------|---------------------|----------------|---------------------|-----------|
| <code>economic</code> | 3,523 | 118.09 | 18,535 | 213.04 | 1,172.92 |
| <code>economics</code> | 420 | 14.08 | 2,711 | 31.16 | 276.93 |
| <code>economists</code> | 84 | 2.82 | 685 | 7.87 | 102.80 |

Threat (crime)

| Key word | Freq.-T | <i>T/mil</i> | Freq.-B | <i>B/mil</i> | LL |
|-------------|---------|--------------|---------|--------------|----------|
| crime | 9,237 | 309.62 | 18,697 | 214.91 | 787.92 |
| criminal | 4,366 | 146.35 | 9,781 | 112.42 | 202.56 |
| criminals | 2,575 | 86.31 | 4,195 | 48.22 | 510.36 |
| cronies | 328 | 10.99 | 421 | 4.84 | 117.02 |
| crooks | 350 | 11.73 | 268 | 3.08 | 267.81 |
| gang | 3,401 | 114.00 | 4,391 | 50.47 | 1,199.07 |
| gangmasters | 371 | 12.44 | 531 | 6.10 | 104.14 |
| gangs | 2,723 | 91.27 | 3,944 | 45.33 | 742.67 |
| gangsters | 612 | 20.51 | 866 | 9.95 | 176.50 |
| murder | 6,225 | 208.66 | 11,221 | 128.98 | 878.38 |
| murdered | 2,260 | 75.75 | 4,268 | 49.06 | 265.19 |
| murderer | 574 | 19.24 | 879 | 10.10 | 135.71 |
| murderers | 554 | 18.57 | 922 | 10.60 | 102.80 |
| murdering | 577 | 19.34 | 851 | 9.78 | 150.45 |

Threat (terrorism)

| Key word | Freq.-T | <i>T/mil</i> | Freq.-B | <i>B/mil</i> | LL |
|-----------------|----------------|---------------------|----------------|---------------------|-----------|
| antiterrorism | 76 | 2.55 | 9 | 0.10 | 155.38 |
| antiterrorist | 176 | 5.90 | 14 | 0.16 | 388.82 |
| anthrax | 393 | 13.17 | 391 | 4.49 | 216.71 |
| extremists | 1,313 | 44.01 | 2,543 | 29.23 | 138.12 |
| fanatic | 358 | 12.00 | 335 | 3.85 | 215.04 |
| fanatical | 403 | 13.51 | 478 | 5.49 | 167.23 |
| fanatics | 778 | 26.08 | 536 | 6.16 | 663.45 |

Issues with current system

| Key word | Freq.-T | <i>T/mil</i> | Freq.-B | <i>B/mil</i> | LL |
|-----------------|----------------|---------------------|----------------|---------------------|-----------|
| crisis | 5,084 | 170.41 | 12,013 | 138.08 | 153.53 |
| laws | 4,383 | 146.92 | 7,621 | 87.60 | 703.98 |
| lax | 330 | 11.06 | 397 | 4.56 | 133.43 |
| loophole | 484 | 16.22 | 338 | 3.89 | 407.29 |
| mockery | 388 | 13.01 | 464 | 5.33 | 158.62 |
| problem | 8,224 | 275.66 | 20,084 | 230.85 | 179.06 |

Unwelcome

| Key word | Freq.-T | <i>T/mil</i> | Freq.-B | <i>B/mil</i> | LL |
|-----------------|----------------|---------------------|----------------|---------------------|-----------|
| boot | 988 | 33.12 | 1,178 | 1354 | 406.11 |
| booted | 529 | 17.73 | 169 | 1.94 | 771.26 |
| crack | 1,449 | 48.57 | 2,293 | 26.36 | 312.78 |
| crackdown | 1,659 | 55.61 | 1,523 | 17.51 | 1,022.23 |
| deport | 1,750 | 58.66 | 2,238 | 25.72 | 628.99 |
| deportation | 4,103 | 137.53 | 5,972 | 68.64 | 1,105.71 |
| deported | 5,360 | 179.66 | 6,644 | 76.37 | 2,048.74 |
| deporting | 427 | 14.31 | 590 | 6.78 | 130.11 |
| kick | 1,338 | 44.85 | 2,015 | 23.16 | 330.68 |
| kicked | 1,558 | 52.22 | 1,508 | 17.33 | 893.43 |
| leave | 8,524 | 285.72 | 20,377 | 234.22 | 230.88 |

Plight / Reasons (T)

| n-gram | Freq.-T | <i>T/mil</i> | Freq.-B | <i>B/mil</i> | LL |
|---------------|----------------|--------------|----------------|--------------|-----------|
| desperate | 3,577 | 119.90 | 5,876 | 67.54 | 691.25 |
| desperately | 1,275 | 42.74 | 2,074 | 23.84 | 253.85 |
| devastated | 985 | 33.02 | 1,323 | 15.21 | 319.56 |
| devastating | 885 | 29.66 | 1,631 | 18.75 | 114.68 |
| horrific | 896 | 30.03 | 1,055 | 12.13 | 376.74 |
| horrified | 682 | 22.86 | 959 | 11.02 | 199.61 |
| horror | 1,824 | 61.14 | 3,850 | 44.25 | 124.05 |
| misery | 1,103 | 36.97 | 2,014 | 23.15 | 148.19 |
| tragedy | 2,387 | 80.01 | 4,376 | 50.30 | 315.76 |
| tragic | 1,363 | 45.69 | 2,319 | 26.65 | 235.55 |
| tragically | 293 | 9.82 | 371 | 4.26 | 107.42 |
| victim | 2,965 | 99.38 | 4,703 | 54.06 | 635.77 |
| victims | 4,579 | 153.49 | 10,854 | 124.76 | 134.33 |

Plight / Reasons (B-1)

| Key word | Freq.-T | <i>T/mil</i> | Freq.-B | <i>B/mil</i> | LL |
|-----------------|----------------|---------------------|----------------|---------------------|-----------|
| airstrikes | 56 | 1.88 | 552 | 6.34 | 104.62 |
| ceasefire | 400 | 13.41 | 2,801 | 32.20 | 332.20 |
| conflict | 2,113 | 70.83 | 10,346 | 118.92 | 526.07 |
| conflicts | 245 | 8.21 | 1,628 | 18.71 | 175.77 |
| coup | 449 | 15.05 | 2,428 | 27.91 | 165.64 |
| displaced | 418 | 14.01 | 2,650 | 30.46 | 261.23 |
| dissident | 199 | 6.67 | 1,303 | 14.98 | 136.83 |
| dissidents | 107 | 3.59 | 1,046 | 12.02 | 196.45 |
| earthquake | 197 | 6.60 | 1,199 | 13.78 | 108.58 |
| exile | 562 | 18.84 | 4,447 | 51.11 | 639.54 |
| exiles | 174 | 5.83 | 1,451 | 16.68 | 224.52 |
| genocide | 607 | 20.35 | 4,184 | 48.09 | 482.78 |
| holocaust | 896 | 30.03 | 5,229 | 60.10 | 431.16 |
| insurgency | 24 | 0.80 | 469 | 5.39 | 150.20 |
| massacres | 223 | 7.47 | 1,322 | 15.20 | 112.98 |

Plight / Reasons (B-2)

| Key word | Freq.-T | <i>T/mil</i> | Freq.-B | <i>B/mil</i> | LL |
|-----------------|----------------|---------------------|----------------|---------------------|-----------|
| militants | 568 | 19.04 | 2,879 | 33.09 | 163.31 |
| military | 5,466 | 183.22 | 25,578 | 294.00 | 1,111.73 |
| militia | 437 | 14.65 | 2,684 | 30.85 | 247.82 |
| militiamen | 100 | 3.35 | 842 | 9.68 | 131.98 |
| militias | 149 | 4.99 | 1,627 | 18.70 | 342.59 |
| nationalism | 216 | 7.24 | 1,745 | 20.06 | 258.48 |
| nationalist | 370 | 12.40 | 2,277 | 26.17 | 211.12 |
| occupation | 574 | 19.24 | 4,159 | 47.80 | 522.34 |
| occupied | 764 | 25.61 | 4,674 | 53.72 | 427.98 |
| rebel | 770 | 25.81 | 4,467 | 51.34 | 363.25 |
| rebels | 809 | 27.12 | 6,040 | 69.42 | 795.88 |
| sanctions | 396 | 13.27 | 2,568 | 29.52 | 264.71 |
| survivors | 884 | 29.63 | 3,772 | 43.36 | 111.96 |

Collocates

(node: *refugees*)

- Statistic: Mutual Information (MI)
- In all cases, $MI \geq 3$
- Min. frequency of collocate: 5
- Span: ± 5
- Not calculated beyond sentence break

- **Red** indicates collocation only in **tabloids**
- **Blue** indicates collocation only in **broadsheets**
- **Black** indicates collocation in both

Number + quantity metaphors

| Collocate | MI-T | MI-B |
|-----------|-------|-------|
| convoy | 4.70 | ----- |
| flock | 5.64 | ----- |
| flocked | ----- | 4.84 |
| flocking | 6.25 | ----- |
| flood | 4.90 | 4.20 |
| flooded | ----- | 4.93 |
| flooding | 7.64 | 5.20 |
| freight | ----- | 4.27 |
| herded | 7.02 | ----- |
| load | ----- | 3.22 |
| million | ----- | 6.23 |
| numbering | ----- | 6.40 |

| Collocate | MI-T | MI-B |
|-------------|-------|-------|
| overcrowded | 4.72 | ----- |
| pour | 6.51 | 5.55 |
| poured | 6.06 | 5.55 |
| pouring | 6.88 | 5.73 |
| stormed | 4.47 | ----- |
| stream | 4.67 | ----- |
| streamed | ----- | 6.63 |
| streaming | 8.42 | 7.27 |
| swamp | 5.58 | ----- |
| swamping | 5.87 | ----- |
| swarmed | 7.13 | ----- |
| swells | ----- | 6.56 |

- **Word forms**
- 10 unique to the Tabloids
- 8 unique to the Broadsheets
- 6 common to the two corpora

- **Headwords**
- 6 unique to the Tabloids,
- 5 unique to the Broadsheets
- 4 common

- In all cases of common collocates, the MI score is higher in the Tabloids (significant?)

Plight (1)

| | MI-T | MI-B |
|------------|-------|------|
| bombed | 4.76 | 3.38 |
| brutality | 4.48 | ---- |
| carnage | 4.48 | ---- |
| cleansed | ----- | 5.76 |
| crammed | 5.90 | 4.83 |
| despair | 3.01 | ---- |
| desperate | 4.33 | 3.15 |
| destitute | ----- | 4.26 |
| devastated | 3.75 | ---- |
| dispersed | 6.72 | 4.95 |
| displaced | ----- | 6.85 |
| drowned | ---- | 3.74 |
| endured | ---- | 3.23 |
| evicted | 5.35 | ---- |
| eviction | 4.85 | ---- |
| exhausted | ---- | 3.15 |

| | MI-T | MI-B |
|-----------|-------|------|
| fate | 3.18 | ---- |
| fled | 6.07 | 6.16 |
| flee | 6.95 | 5.97 |
| fleeing | 7.93 | 7.21 |
| forced | 4.32 | 3.65 |
| forcibly | 5.23 | 3.83 |
| freeze | ---- | 3.60 |
| freezing | ---- | 3.69 |
| herded | ---- | 4.41 |
| holed | ----- | 4.36 |
| homeless | ----- | 4.55 |
| horrific | 4.30 | ---- |
| hunger | 4.64 | 3.65 |
| hungry | 3.51 | ---- |
| huddled | 6.60 | 4.76 |
| massacred | ----- | 5.04 |

Plight (2)

| | MI-T | MI-B |
|-------------|-------|-------|
| ordeal | 4.39 | ---- |
| persecution | 5.22 | 4.15 |
| plight | 5.04 | 4.01 |
| plucked | ----- | 4.91 |
| prevented | 4.57 | ---- |
| ravaged | 5.15 | ---- |
| scattered | 4.50 | 4.78 |
| scramble | 6.05 | ---- |
| shelled | 6.31 | ----- |
| shelter | ---- | 4.75 |
| sheltered | ---- | 4.30 |
| sheltering | 7.33 | 6.59 |
| slaughter | 4.95 | ---- |
| slaughtered | 4.41 | ---- |
| squalid | ---- | 4.65 |

| | MI-T | MI-B |
|------------|-------|-------|
| squalor | 4.97 | ---- |
| squeezed | ----- | 4.01 |
| starvation | 4.35 | 4.57 |
| starved | ----- | 4.05 |
| starving | 5.29 | 3.18 |
| stranded | 6.81 | 6.21 |
| subjected | 4.29 | ----- |
| suffer | 3.55 | ----- |
| suffering | 3.52 | ----- |
| suffocated | 5.02 | ----- |
| torn | 5.43 | 3.51 |
| tragic | 3.11 | ----- |
| trapped | 5.96 | 4.20 |
| vanished | 4.05 | ----- |
| weep | 6.20 | ----- |

Plight: Overall picture

| | T | B | Both | Total |
|-------------------|------------|------------|-------------|--------------|
| Word-forms | 24 (38.7%) | 19 (30.6%) | 19 (30.6%) | 62 |
| Headwords | 18 (37.5%) | 14 (29.2%) | 16 (33.3%) | 48 |

More frequent in tabloids, but picture seems more or less balanced.

N-grams

- Calculated manually to include modifying adjectives (denoting origin, ethnicity, race, age, religion, type of work) and related terms.
- Method: concordance of target term (*illegal, fake*) in the co-text (± 25) of query terms.
- Statistic: Log Likelihood (Paul Rayson's LL calculator)
- Min. LL score: 6.6 ($p \leq 0.01$)
- **Red** indicates more frequent in **tabloids**
- **Blue** indicates more frequent in **broadsheets**
- **Bold** indicates both singular and plural (only when the two forms are not key in the same corpus)
- Black indicates difference is not statistically significant

Illegal entry

| n-gram | Freq.-T | T/mil | Freq.-B | B/mil | LL |
|----------------------------|----------------|--------------------|----------------|--------------------|-------------|
| illegal arrivals | 12 | <i>0.40</i> | 20 | <i>0.23</i> | 2.20 |
| illegal crossing | 12 | <i>0.40</i> | 10 | <i>0.11</i> | 8.32 |
| illegal crossings | 2 | <i>0.07</i> | 8 | <i>0.09</i> | 0.17 |
| illegal crossing(s) | 14 | <i>0.47</i> | 18 | <i>0.20</i> | 4.96 |
| illegal entrant | 5 | <i>0.17</i> | 98 | <i>1.13</i> | 31.50 |
| illegal entrants | 75 | <i>2.51</i> | 192 | <i>2.21</i> | 0.88 |
| illegal entrant(s) | 80 | <i>2.68</i> | 290 | <i>3.34</i> | 3.14 |
| <i>illegal entries</i> | 12 | <i>0.40</i> | 10 | <i>0.11</i> | 8.32 |
| <i>illegal entry</i> | 227 | <i>7.61</i> | 316 | <i>3.63</i> | 67.71 |
| <i>illegal stowaways</i> | 11 | <i>0.37</i> | 9 | <i>0.10</i> | 7.79 |

Illegally in country (1)

| n-gram | Freq.-T | <i>T/mil</i> | Freq.-B | <i>B/mil</i> | LL |
|--------------------------------------|----------------|---------------------|----------------|---------------------|-----------|
| illegal [adjective] immigrant(s) | 141 | 4.72 | 217 | 2.49 | 32.73 |
| illegal [adjective] refugee(s) | 2 | 0.07 | 1 | 0.01 | 2.23 |
| illegal [adjective] asylum seeker(s) | ----- | ----- | ----- | ----- | ----- |
| illegal [adjective] migrant(s) | 2 | 0.07 | 21 | 0.24 | 4.27 |
| illegal alien | 29 | 0.97 | 63 | 0.72 | 1.67 |
| illegal aliens | 64 | 2.15 | 142 | 1.63 | 3.14 |
| illegal emigrants | 5 | 0.17 | 9 | 0.10 | 0.70 |
| illegal emigration | 4 | 0.13 | 19 | 0.22 | 0.88 |
| illegal foreigners | 6 | 0.20 | 8 | 0.09 | 1.97 |
| illegal immigrant | 1530 | 51.28 | 1109 | 12.75 | 1237.42 |
| illegal immigrants | 6862 | 230.01 | 5558 | 63.88 | 4919.59 |
| illegal immigration | 1402 | 46.49 | 1680 | 19.31 | 568.99 |

Illegally in country (2)

| | | | | | |
|-------------------------------------|-----|-------------|-------|-------------|--------|
| illegal migrant | 41 | <i>1.37</i> | 78 | <i>0.90</i> | 4.63 |
| illegal migrants | 224 | <i>7.51</i> | 545 | <i>6.26</i> | 4.98 |
| illegal migration | 30 | <i>1.01</i> | 98 | <i>1.13</i> | 0.31 |
| illegal overstayer | 5 | <i>0.17</i> | 11 | <i>0.13</i> | 0.26 |
| illegal overstayers | 2 | <i>0.07</i> | ----- | ----- | 5.46 |
| illegal refugee | 10 | <i>0.34</i> | 3 | <i>0.03</i> | 15.00 |
| illegal refugees | 41 | <i>1.37</i> | 30 | <i>0.34</i> | 32.84 |
| illegal residence | 2 | <i>0.07</i> | 5 | <i>0.06</i> | 0.03 |
| illegal residents | 2 | <i>0.07</i> | 22 | <i>0.25</i> | 4.68 |
| illegal asylum seeker | 10 | <i>0.34</i> | 18 | <i>0.21</i> | 1.41 |
| illegal asylum seekers | 121 | <i>4.06</i> | 83 | <i>0.95</i> | 103.39 |
| illegal immigrant population | 8 | <i>0.27</i> | 4 | <i>0.04</i> | 8.91 |

Illegal means to stay

| n-gram | Freq.-T | <i>T/mil</i> | Freq.-B | <i>B/mil</i> | LL |
|-------------------|----------------|--------------|----------------|--------------|-----------|
| illegal documents | 5 | 0.17 | 3 | | 4.83 |
| illegal marriages | 5 | 0.17 | ----- | ----- | 13.64 |
| illegal passport | 4 | 0.13 | ----- | ----- | 10.91 |
| illegal passports | 3 | 0.10 | 6 | 0.07 | 0.27 |

Next slide: Illegal work

| n-gram | Freq.-T | T/mil | Freq.-B | B/mil | LL |
|----------------------------------|----------------|--------------|----------------|--------------|-----------|
| illegal economic migrants | 7 | 0.23 | 13 | 0.15 | 0.87 |
| illegal economic migration | 1 | 0.04 | 5 | 0.06 | 0.27 |
| illegal employment | 20 | 0.67 | 25 | 0.29 | 7.49 |
| illegal job | 8 | 0.27 | 6 | 0.07 | 6.24 |
| illegal labour | 39 | 1.31 | 48 | 0.55 | 15.05 |
| illegal migrant labour | 3 | 0.10 | 8 | 0.09 | 0.02 |
| illegal labourers | 3 | 0.10 | 8 | 0.09 | 0.02 |
| illegal work | 19 | 0.64 | 28 | 0.32 | 4.94 |
| illegal worker | 31 | 1.04 | 46 | 0.53 | 7.92 |
| illegal workers | 283 | 9.49 | 316 | 3.63 | 130.00 |
| illegal workforce | 4 | 0.14 | 7 | 0.08 | 0.62 |
| illegal working | 100 | 3.35 | 169 | 1.94 | 17.56 |
| illegal foreign workers | 12 | 0.40 | 19 | 0.22 | 2.57 |
| illegal immigrant workers | 22 | 0.74 | 20 | 0.23 | 13.69 |
| illegal migrant workers | 4 | 0.14 | 24 | 0.28 | 2.12 |
| illegal [ADJ] worker | 1 | 0.04 | 2 | 0.02 | 0.09 |
| illegal [ADJ] workers | 10 | 0.34 | 27 | 0.31 | 0.04 |

Problem

| n-gram | Freq.-T | T/mil | Freq.-B | B/mil | LL |
|-----------------------------------|----------------|--------------|----------------|--------------|-----------|
| <i>illegal immigrant problem</i> | 17 | <i>0.57</i> | 1 | <i>0.01</i> | 39.24 |
| illegal immigration problem | 8 | <i>0.27</i> | 8 | <i>0.09</i> | 4.37 |
| <i>illegal immigration crisis</i> | 6 | <i>0.20</i> | ----- | ----- | 16.37 |
| <i>illegal immigration racket</i> | 10 | <i>0.34</i> | 5 | <i>0.06</i> | 11.14 |
| illegal immigration rackets | 12 | <i>0.40</i> | 17 | <i>0.20</i> | 3.44 |
| <i>illegal immigrant racket</i> | 7 | <i>0.23</i> | 2 | <i>0.02</i> | 10.74 |
| illegal immigration reform | ---- | ---- | 5 | <i>0.06</i> | 2.95 |

and

| n-gram | Freq.-T | <i>T/mil</i> | Freq.-B | <i>B/mil</i> | LL |
|--|----------------|---------------------|----------------|---------------------|-----------|
| illegal immigration and crime | 14 | <i>0.47</i> | 12 | <i>0.14</i> | 9.39 |
| illegal immigrants and criminals | 16 | <i>0.54</i> | 3 | <i>0.03</i> | 28.84 |
| illegal immigration and fraud | 11 | <i>0.37</i> | 1 | <i>0.01</i> | 23.71 |
| illegal immigration and smuggling | ---- | ---- | 7 | <i>0.08</i> | 4.13 |
| illegal immigrants and terrorists | 14 | <i>0.47</i> | 4 | <i>0.05</i> | 21.48 |
| illegal immigration and terrorism | 13 | <i>0.44</i> | 11 | <i>0.13</i> | 8.85 |

N-grams with *illegal*: overall picture

| n-gram | Freq.-T | <i>T/mil</i> | Freq.-B | <i>B/mil</i> | LL |
|------------------------------|----------------|---------------------|----------------|---------------------|-----------|
| <i>illegal</i> [total] | 13637 | 457.10 | 15687 | 180.31 | 5954.10 |
| <i>illegally in country</i> | 9724 | 325.40 | 10543 | 121.18 | 4687.96 |
| <i>illegal entry</i> | 356 | 11.91 | 663 | 7.62 | 43.92 |
| <i>illegal means to stay</i> | 17 | 0.57 | 9 | 0.10 | 18.15 |
| <i>work illegally</i> | 567 | 18.98 | 771 | 8.85 | 178.31 |

A more complex picture n-grams with *POSE AS*

| | Freq.-T | <i>T/mil</i> | Freq.-B | <i>B/mil</i> | LL |
|------------------------|----------------|--------------|----------------|--------------|-----------|
| POSE AS | 723 | 24.19 | 753 | 8.66 | 371.29 |
| POSE AS + RASIM | 214 (29.6%) | 7.16 | 78 (10.4%) | 0.89 | 290.87 |

Tabloids use POSE AS more frequently than broadsheets both in general and in relation to RASIM.

X pose as *RAS* to gain entry (1)
Presented as fact, or taken for granted

| Stance | T | B | X = ... |
|--|------------------------|-----------------------|--|
| <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Positive stance towards ‘tougher measures’ ▪ (Direct/indirect) negative stance towards RASIM. | <p>110 (51.4%)</p> | <p>46 (58.9%)</p> | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ foreigners ▪ terrorists ▪ fanatics/militants ▪ gangs/criminals/crooks ▪ spies ▪ beggars |

Albanian Plakici, 26, posed as a frightened refugee from war-torn Kosovo when he arrived in Britain seven years ago. He was first granted political asylum and was given a British passport in January 2002. The skilled linguist was so plausible he landed a string of jobs as an interpreter with firms of solicitors specialising in immigration and asylum cases. He even tricked BBC producers into hiring him as an expert for a documentary on the controversial subject. In reality, Plakici was a ruthless trafficker in naive young women from the poverty-stricken former Soviet bloc. He lured them to Britain with promises of work as barmaids or waitresses, only to force them into the vice trade once they arrived.

[*The Express*, December 23, 2003]

Sarajevo has long been condemned by Britain and others as an easy backdoor route to Europe for Islamic terrorists posing as asylum-seekers. Muslims do not need visas for Bosnia and only cursory checks are made on the identities of incoming passengers.

[*The Times*, October 11, 2001]

X pose as RAS to gain entry (2)

Reported as the view of politicians etc.

| Stance | T | B | X = ... |
|--|------------------------|-------------------------|--|
| <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Negative stance towards ‘tougher measures’ ▪ Neutral/positive stance towards RASIM. | <p>---</p> <p>(0%)</p> | <p>9</p> <p>(11.5%)</p> | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ foreigners ▪ terrorists ▪ fanatics/militants ▪ gangs/criminals/crooks ▪ spies ▪ beggars |

Comfort Afolabi, the head of the DSHU, has been accused in a documentary made by BBC Radio Five Live of putting the reporter - who was posing as an asylum seeker - in touch with an associate who agreed on a fee of pounds 800 for a fake passport and national insurance number. Mrs Afolabi has strongly denied any wrongdoing. The BLF said it would conduct an inquiry to establish whether the lottery funds awarded to the DSHU were used for their intended purpose - to provide support for asylum seekers.

[*The Daily Telegraph*, February 28, 2005]

Immigrants pose as *RAS* to gain entry (3)

Current system forces immigrants to do so

| Stance | T | B |
|---|-------------|-------------|
| • Neutral to positive stance towards RASIM. | --- (0%) | 1 (1.3%) |

There might have been an immigration crisis 20 years ago, although that is debatable, but the so-called "system" of immigration that Britain is stuck with serves to deprive our industry of essential talent (much of which has then migrated elsewhere) while effectively obliging some individuals to pose as "bogus" asylum-seekers in an attempt to enter the country.

[*The Times*, September 11, 2005]

X pose as (illegal) *RASIM* to expose problems with asylum system

| Stance | T | B | X = ... |
|---|-----------------------|-----------------------|---|
| <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Positive stance towards practice ▪ Positive stance towards 'tougher measures' ▪ Indirectly negative stance towards RASIM. | <p>49 (22.9%)</p> | <p>13 (16.7%)</p> | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ reporters ▪ police |

Our girl investigator posing as an illegal Russian immigrant arranged to meet the crooked secretary who works at the Angel College in Islington which prepares students for entrance to universities as well as teaching them English. College bosses are unaware of her bent sideline. In a hotel lobby, Elena told us she charges between £25 and £75 for each document and said they are foolproof.

[*The People*, June 5, 2005]

Rosseti specialises in what he calls "the Italian package" - a genuine Italian passport which comes complete with driving licence and identity document. Last week a Sunday Times reporter approached Rosseti posing as a Yugoslavian refugee needing a passport to remain in Britain. They met at a coffee bar in Soho, central London. "If you want to sleep easy at night take the Italian Job," said Rosseti. "All the documents are genuine and I can guarantee you will be registered by computer as an Italian citizen."

[*Sunday Times*, September 28, 1997]

RASIM pose as X to exploit system / 'citizens'

| Stance | T | B | X = ... |
|--|---------------|-------------|---|
| <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Negative stance towards RASIM. | 50 (23.4%) | --- (0%) | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ doctors ▪ nurses ▪ students ▪ taxi drivers ▪ workers ▪ scientists ▪ sports fans ▪ athletes ▪ artists ▪ EU citizens ▪ tourists |

HUNDREDS of asylum seekers are pouring into Britain posing as nurses. They are ruthlessly exploiting a desperate shortage in NHS staff to sneak into the country carrying bogus medical qualifications. Their documents - supplied at a huge price by criminal gangs - trick authorities into believing they are properly trained and ready to work in British hospitals.

[*Daily Star*, December 1, 2002]

Criminals etc. pose as X to exploit / harm RASIM

| Stance | T | B | X = ... |
|----------------------------------|-------------|-------------|---|
| • Positive stance towards RASIM. | 4 (1.9%) | --- (0%) | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ aid workers ▪ peacekeepers |

Serbian soldiers posed as peacekeepers to capture refugees, a war crimes court heard yesterday at the trial of the commander accused of the 1995 massacre of Moslems at Srebrenica. General Radislav Krstic, the highest-ranking Bosnian Serb officer to face the tribunal, denies command responsibility for genocide in which 7,500 people were killed or are still missing. Prosecutors showed video footage which revealed how Serb troops tricked Moslems with confiscated UN clothing.

[*The Daily mail*, March 15, 2000]

A closer look

**Examination of instances of *suffocated*
in relation to RASIM
to establish how their plight is presented**

Negative presentation was of two general types

Direct negative presentation

- through **negative attribution** by
 - modification with the adjective *illegal*;
 - reference to the victims as *illegal cargo*.

In June, 58 **illegal immigrants** from China suffocated in the back of a lorry in Dover, after a journey across Europe" [*The Express*, Nov. 2000].

"A Dutch lorry driver was jailed for 14 years for killing 58 Chinese immigrants who suffocated in his trailer as he tried to smuggle them into Britain. Perry Wacker, 33, closed an air vent during the Channel crossing so that the ferry crew could not hear his **illegal cargo**" [*The Daily Mail*, June 2001].

Indirect negative presentation

- through **framing** the report of the suffocation within
 - references to *illegal immigrants* etc. in general;
 - references to *smuggling, trafficking, illegal transport/entry*, and problems with existing system;
 - references to problems with, or laxity of, the existing immigration system

China is among the top four countries whose citizens are **sneaking in**. It does not want a repeat of such tragedies as the drowning last year in Morecambe Bay or in 2000 when 58 Chinese suffocated in the back of a lorry heading for Dover.

[*The Times*, Sept. 2005].

The risks of **trafficking** were highlighted last summer by the deaths of 58 Chinese immigrants found suffocated in a Dutch-owned truck which arrived in Dover from Belgium. **Illegal immigration** is also expected to be high on the agenda of an Anglo-French summit in Cahors, southern France ...

[*The Guardian*, Feb. 2001]

Overall picture

| | T | B | LL |
|----------------------------------|----------------|----------------|-----------|
| Freq. of <i>suffocated</i> | 227 | 332 | 65.30 |
| In relation to RASIM | 166 (73.1%) | 168 (50.6%) | 11.25 |
| Negative attribution [Direct] | 47 (28.3%) | 33 (19.6%) | 2.63 |
| Negative framing [Indirect] | 29 (17.5%) | 44 (26.2%) | 2.93 |
| Negative presentation [TOTAL] | 76 (45.8%) | 77 (45.8%) | 0.00 |

- There is no significant difference in the proportion of negative presentation of the (near) victims of suffocation, which is very high (almost half of the reports).
- Both broadsheets and tabloids seem to try to project a humane face, while at the same time communicating the notion that, since the victims were party to an illegal act, they were somehow (at least partly) responsible for their death.
- The only difference seem to be that broadsheets seem to prefer to use indirect rather than direct negative presentation - though the statistical significance of the differences is rather low.

Some tentative observations

- Overlap in terms of
 - phraseology re. RASIM
 - stance towards RASIM
- Differences are in terms of degree
- T/B distinction not helpful
- Examination of individual newspapers
- Combination of automated and manual techniques